Prentice

Fragments of an early Christian liturgy in Syrian inscriptions

Extracted from the Transactions of the American Philological Association, Vol. xxxiii, 1902.

VI. — *Fragments of an Early Christian Liturgy in Syrian Inscriptions.*

By Professor W. K. PRENTICE,

PRINCETON UNIVERSITY.

The subject of this paper is, of course, somewhat remote from the daily work of most of the members of this association; but I trust that it will not be of less interest on that account, and that it will not be without some actual value.

Nearly three years ago my friend and fellow-traveller in Syria, Dr. Enno Littmann, copied for me an inscription in the ruins at Bshindelinteh, a town in the mountain country immediately to the east of Antioch on the Orontes. The inscription was found on a lintel, apparently that of a church doorway, and was so badly weathered that Dr. Littmann's copy was necessarily imperfect. At first it seemed impossible to make anything out of this inscription, except that it was distinctly religious in character, and I despaired of being able to decipher it unless I could find a clew elsewhere. Many inscriptions of this sort, published by Waddington and others, contain more or less literal quotations from the Bible; but it was easy to make certain that no Biblical quotation was involved here. It then occurred to me that possibly this inscription contained a quotation from some form of public worship in use among the churches of this region, and that the passage quoted might be found in some of the Greek liturgies which have had a literary tradition. This proved to be the case (cf. C. A. Swainson, *The Greek Liturgies*, 1884, p. 12, n. 3, pp. 14, 226, 383), and it then became a simple matter to restore the full text of the inscription, which is as follows:

Ἅγιος ὁ Θεός, ἅγιος ἰ[σ](χ)υρός,
ἅγιος ἀθάνατος, (σ)τα(υ)ροθ(εὶ)ς
δι' ἡμᾶς, ἠλ[έ]ησον ἡμᾶς.

Holy God, holy Mighty (One),
holy Deathless (One), crucified
for us, have mercy upon us!

This is the famous *trisagion*, Ἅγιος ὁ Θεός, ἅγιος ἰσχυρός, ἅγιος ἀθάνατος, ἐλέησον ἡμᾶς, together with the phrase ὁ σταυρωθεὶς δι' ἡμᾶς, inserted by the heretic Peter the Fuller, bishop of Antioch, about the year 470 A.D. The insertion of this phrase was a part of a fierce ecclesiastical controversy. The orthodox churchmen of the fifth century, believing that all such formulae of worship should apply to the Trinity, had interpreted the threefold invocation of the trisagion as referring successively to the three Persons of the Godhead, and considered the subject of the verb ἐλέησον to be the Trinity thus invoked. On the other hand, the sect of the monophysites, which was strongly represented in Antioch at this time, applied the whole invocation to the one *God*, and Peter, in inserting the words "Who wast crucified for us," made the trisagion a distinctly monophysite formula, asserting that *God* was crucified.

The trisagion, or *hymnus trisagius*, is to be distinguished from the *hymnus tersanctus*, or "triumphal hymn," of which I shall have occasion to speak in a moment: the latter is one of the earliest hymns of the Christian Church, and had a place also in the Jewish ritual. The trisagion is not properly a hymn, but a short invocation, often thrice repeated, and is found in most of the Eastern liturgies, as for example in the Alexandrine liturgy, called the "Liturgy of St. Mark," in the so-called "Liturgy of St. James," and in the Syriac liturgies: it was usually employed in the service after the "little entrance," and before the lections. It is not found, however, in the so-called "Liturgy of St. Clement," which, although it was doubtless the early liturgy of the Roman Church, is thought to have originated in Antioch. This liturgy is probably older than the present form of any other, inasmuch as it is contained in the "*Apostolic Constitutions*," a compilation which is believed to have received its present form in the fourth century.

There is some uncertainty as to the age of the trisagion; but the traditional story of its origin is too edifying to pass over lightly. According to John of Damascus, a writer of the eighth century, and Nicephorus Callistus, of the four-

teenth, it seems that in the time of Theodosius the Younger, when Proclus was bishop of Constantinople, *i.e.* between 434 and 446 A.D., there were violent earthquakes, occasioning innumerable disasters on land and sea, great loss of life, and a general panic, so that the people of Constantinople held public services, making supplication unto God to avert their total destruction. And while they were praying, "a child was taken up from among them, and so was taught, by the teaching of the angels in some way, the thrice holy hymn: 'Holy God, holy Mighty One, holy Deathless One, have mercy upon us.' And when the child returned and told what it had been taught, the whole multitude sang the hymn, and thus the calamity was stayed." Some say that shortly afterwards the child died (Nicephorus Callistus, *Eccl. Hist.* XIV, 46; John of Damascus, *Expos. Fidei Orthod.*, III, 10. Cf. John Dam., *Epistola ad Jordanem de Hymno Trisagio*). Whatever may be the true date of the trisagion itself, however, there is a general agreement as to the origin of the heretical phrase added to it and contained in the Bshindelinteh inscription: this phrase is ascribed, as I have said, to Peter the Fuller, a cleric of somewhat unsavory reputation, who became bishop of Antioch. Theodorus Lector, a writer of the sixth century, in his *Ecclesiastical History*, I, 20, said: "When Martyrius held the episcopate of the church of Antioch, Zeno, the *magister militum*, who had married Ariadne, the daughter of the Emperor Leo, came to Antioch. In his company was a certain Peter, who was called '*Fullo*,' a presbyter of the church of St. Bassa the Martyr, which is in Chalcedon. And, coveting the throne of that city (Antioch), he persuaded Zeno to join with him in his undertaking. Then, giving money to some of the sect of Apollinarius, he stirred up countless tumults against the faith and against Martyrius the bishop, anathematizing those who did not say that *God* was crucified. In doing so he brought the people to faction, and in the trisagion Peter added the phrase 'ὁ σταυρωθεὶς δι' ἡμᾶς.'" The "*Libellus Synodicus*" adds that Peter called a "vile council" (μιαρὰν σύνοδον) to establish his addition to the "hymn."

The first accession of Peter to the episcopal throne of Antioch, about the year 470, affords, therefore, a definite *terminus post quem* for this inscription. And it is, of course, possible that the new formula was carried at once to the little town in the hill country where the inscription was found. But this is unlikely. Furthermore, it is unlikely that a formula, whose orthodoxy was still a subject of fierce dispute, should be accepted by the country people, unless it were in deference to an authority which seemed to them both complete and permanent. But Peter's position in his diocese was never secure. Not long afterwards, however, when Severus was bishop of Antioch, from 512 to 519, the monophysites became dominant in all this region, and enforced with violence the acceptance of their dogmas. This Severus, who was regarded as the true founder of the organized monophysite sect, was a monk who, for his dissolute habits or his heterodox views, or for both, had been driven out from at least one monastery — some say from several — and had come at last to Constantinople, where he joined with Timotheus, afterward bishop of that city (511–517), and others in a determined war upon the orthodox faith. The Emperor Anastasius himself (491–518) declared in favor of the monophysites, and undertook to reduce the orthodox bishops to submission, or to dispossess them of their sees. Through all this movement, Peter's addition to the trisagion was the watchword and war-cry of the party, and crowds of heretic monks, clergy and laity, incited by the emperor and his coadjutors, together with the rabble which was hired for the purpose in various cities, singing the new version of the old formula, started the riots which preceded the downfall of recalcitrant prelates. At Constantinople mobs in two of the principal churches "in singing the trisagion added the words 'Who wast crucified for us,' so that the orthodox of necessity drove them out with blows" (Theophanes, *Chronographia*, p. 132). Once installed, and confident in the support of the emperor and the bishop of Constantinople, Severus seems to have entered on a career of violence and intimidation throughout his diocese. In this he had the

hearty coöperation of his subordinate, the infamous Peter of Apamea. Among the stories told of their cruelty and oppression in the memorial presented by a body of Eastern monks to Memnas, the orthodox bishop of Constantinople, in 536, is the account of how a company of "Hebrew robbers," employed for this purpose by Severus and Peter, waylaid a band of 350 old men who were travelling to the monastery of St. Simeon, doubtless the great Ḳalʿat Sim'ân, not far from the town of this inscription. The pilgrims were killed, and their bodies stripped and left unburied (*Sacr. Conciliorum Coll.*, ed. Mansi, V, p. 998 f.). It is not impossible that at such a time the church at Bshindelinteh had the formula of the triumphant faction carved on its lintel, either to win the favor of those at that time in power, or to protect the community during this reign of terror, or perhaps even in consequence of a direct threat.

Severus's power soon came to an end. In 518 Anastasius died, Justin became emperor, and Severus was deposed: there never was another legitimate monophysite bishop of Antioch. The monophysite formula does not seem to have been forbidden at once, for even the orthodox Ephraem, who was bishop of Antioch from 527 to 545, in a letter to Zenobius of Emesa, defended its use on the ground that those who applied the whole trisagion to Christ alone might without sin add the phrase "Who wast crucified for us" (Photius, cod. 228, a, 40 ff.). But certainly after the fall of Severus the addition of the words in question was never compulsory in the Catholic Church, and was soon discontinued in most places. Nicephorus Callistus (XVIII, 51) says: "This heresy, which was begun by Cnapheus (*i.e.* Peter the Fuller) and attained its growth to a great extent from Severus and his followers, not long afterward was entirely quenched, it having been abolished in the Church of God, and persisting still only among the Armenians, who do not choose to be obedient to the catholic traditions." And as a matter of fact the trisagion with the addition does not occur in any of the traditional liturgies, so far as I have been able to discover, except in that of the Armenian Church. In the ancient

Syriac liturgies which I have been able to examine, viz. through the Latin translations, the trisagion occurs without the addition. The dialogue, however, between "The Jacobite" and "The Melcite," written early in the thirteenth century by David, son of Paul, and published in part by Assemani in the "*Bibliotheca Orientalis,*" I, p. 518 ff., proves that in this century the trisagion with the addition was still in use in at least one branch of the Jacobite Church. Assemani also says that in the liturgical books printed in Rome for the Maronites of Syria in his time (the middle of the eighteenth century) the trisagion with the addition occurred. It is quite possible, therefore, that the church of Bshindelinteh belonged to the Jacobite denomination, which was formally organized in the time of Justinian, about 535 A.D., but which some of the Jacobites considered to have begun with Severus. This conclusion is strengthened by the fact that I found the trisagion with the addition again in a fragment of an inscription at Selemîyeh, a town about twenty miles east-southeast of Ḥamā. Two other inscriptions also contain the trisagion, one at Mektebeh and one at il-Khanâṣir; but these are so fragmentary that it is not possible to say with certainty whether they included the heretical phrase or not. Now it is not altogether surprising, but it is of some importance to have positive proof that certain communities in Northern Syria in the fifth or sixth century employed a liturgy which contained the monophysite form of the trisagion.

The discovery of the source of the four inscriptions just described naturally suggested an examination of the unpublished inscriptions in my possession and those from this region already published, with a view to finding, if possible, other fragments of the early ritual in use there. I collected in all about fifty texts of distinctly liturgical character, contained of course in a larger number of inscriptions. These are all from the region which lies immediately to the east of Antioch, and date from the fourth, fifth, and sixth centuries: five of them, which I shall discuss first (nos. 2–6), are contained verbatim in some extant liturgy.

2. The most interesting of these, in some ways, is one found in Ḥâss, on a mausoleum which dates probably from the fifth century, and of which I shall have occasion to speak again: it is the so-called "Tomb of Diogenes." The inscription, published by Waddington (*Inscriptions Grecques et Latines de la Syrie*, 1870), no. 2661 a, is as follows:

Εὐλογημένος ὁ ἐρχόμενος ἐν ὀνόματι Κυρίου. Θεὸς Κύριος καὶ ἐπίφανεν ἡμῖν.

Blessed (*be*) *he that cometh in the name of the Lord. God* (*is*) *the Lord, and hath shewed us light.*

This is taken from Psalm cxvii. 26 and 27 (cf. Matt. xxi. 9). But Ps. cxv.–cxviii., to quote from Mr. Warren (F. E. Warren, *The Liturgy and Ritual of the Ante-Nicene Church*, 1897, p. 33), "formed the second part of the *Hallel*, and were sung by every Jewish family or company at the conclusion of the Paschal Supper": they are generally supposed to have constituted "the hymn recorded to have been sung by our Saviour and His disciples after the institution and reception of the first Christian Eucharist." Almost the same words as those in this inscription occur in the "*Apostolic Constitutions*," VII, 27: εὐλογημένος ὁ ἐρχόμενος ἐν ὀνόματι Κυρίου· Θεὸς Κύριος ὁ ἐπιφανεὶς ἡμῖν ἐν σαρκί. The first part also occurs in the so-called "Liturgy of St. James" (Swainson, p. 268), as a part of the *hymnus tersanctus*, or "triumphal hymn," to which I have already alluded, and which is said by Mr. Warren (p. 171) to have "formed a part of every known liturgy." It also forms a part of the Jewish *Kedusha* (Warren, p. 215).

3. Another liturgical passage occurs in two unpublished inscriptions, one found at Wâdī Marthûn and the other at il-Bârah, and again in a second inscription from il-Bârah published by Waddington, no. 2647. All these are undated. The first two are over doorways which apparently led to private dwellings, while the third is on a window lintel. The first and third are fragmentary: the second is as follows:

Δόξα ἐν ὑψίστοις Θεῷ, καὶ ἐπὶ γῆς εἰρήνη, ἐν ἀνθρώποις εὐδοκία.

Glory to God in the highest, and on earth peace, good will among men.

This passage is taken from Luke ii. 14, and is especially interesting in view of the dispute as to the reading *εὐδοκία* or *εὐδοκίας*. It also occurs in the "Liturgy of St. James" (Swainson, p. 254), to be repeated three times, and in the Coptic liturgy (Swainson, p. 395).

4. The *Gloria Patri,* or "Lesser Doxology," is found in several inscriptions, one of which is in an underground rock-hewn tomb at Kōkanâyā, dated in the month Lous, 369 A.D. (Waddington, no. 2681). The whole inscription is as follows:

Εὐσεβίῳ Χριστιανῷ. Δόξα Πατρὶ καὶ Υἱῷ καὶ ἁγίῳ Πνεύ[μα]τι. Ἔτους ζιυʹ, μηνὶ Λώου κζʹ.

For Eusebius a Christian. Glory to the Father, and to the Son, and to the Holy Spirit. In the month Lous, (*on the*) *27th* (*day*), *of the year 417.*

Another inscription, published in part by Chabot, after a copy by M. Poche, in the *Journal Asiat.*, 1901, p. 442, contains the fuller form of this doxology. It is on the lintel of a ruined and half-buried building, probably a tomb, at il-Khanâṣir: Δόξα Πατρὶ καὶ Οἱοῦ καὶ ἁγίου Πνεύματος, (νῦν) καὶ ἀ(εὶ) κα(ὶ) ε(ἰ)ς τοῦς [αἰ](ῶ)νας. Ἀμήν. These words are followed by another line, which probably contains the date and the builder's name, but which I have been unable as yet to decipher. The *Gloria Patri* occurs in the "Liturgy of St. James," and in the Coptic liturgy (Sw. pp. 215 ff., 226, and 362: cf. pp. 16, 76, 220, and 373).

5. In one inscription, found at Ḥâss on a lintel ornamented with an almost classic egg-and-dart moulding, the *Gloria Patri* is followed by the words

Σῶσον Κύριε τὸν λαόν σου·

Lord save thy people!

The passage is undoubtedly taken from Ps. xxvii. 9; but it also occurs in the "Liturgy of St. James" (Sw. p. 230 f.), and near the beginning of the "Liturgy of St. Basil" (Sw. p. 76; cf. pp. 77 and 86): in the latter case these words are immediately preceded by what is practically the equivalent

of the *Gloria Patri:* ὅτι πρέπει σοι πᾶσα δόξα, τιμὴ καὶ προσκύνησις, τῷ Πατρί, καί (κτλ.).

6. Another inscription, found by M. de Vogüé at il-Bârah (Wad. no. 2650), contains the sentence

Κ(ύριο)ς ποιμέν(ι) με καὶ οὐδέν μοι ὑστερήσ(ει).

The Lord is my shepherd; I shall not want.

These words are taken from Ps. xxii. 1: they occur also in the "Liturgy of St. James" (Sw. p. 314).

Each of these six passages which I have thus far described is to be found, in precisely the same form, in one or more of the extant liturgies: all are to be found in the so-called "Liturgy of St. James." While three of them are from the Psalms, one is from the Gospel of Luke, and two are not contained in the Bible at all. Hence they are not simply quotations from the Psalter, and they show that at least some of these Syrian inscriptions *do* contain fragments of the liturgy or ritual employed in the churches of this region between the third and the seventh centuries. They suggest that this liturgy resembled either the "Liturgy of St. James" or the "Liturgy of St. Basil" in their present form more closely than any other of the liturgies which remain to us. They suggest also that inscriptions may furnish some new and independent evidence as to which of the various manuscripts represent most nearly the original form of the liturgies which they contain. For example, of the four Mss. of the "Liturgy of St. James," only the *Codex Rossanensis* and the *Codex Parisinus* no. 2509 contain the passage: Κύριος ποιμαίνει με κτλ.

The rest of the fifty texts are not to be found verbatim in the extant forms of the liturgies; but they are not, on this account, without importance in this connection. For it must be remembered that with the exception of the few brief paragraphs in the "*Didache of the Apostles*," which is thought to date from the second century, and the remains of the liturgy in the "*Apostolic Constitutions*," we have no liturgy whose present form is known to be older than the eighth cen-

tury: the Barberini codex, containing the liturgies called by the names of St. Basil, of St. Chrysostom, and of "The Presanctified," dates from the eighth or ninth century, a fragment in the University Library at Messina, containing a portion of the "Liturgy of St. James," is dated 960, while all the rest are from the twelfth century or later. And these manuscripts do not represent a fixed tradition, like so many copies of various literary productions. This is proved by the wide divergences between the different manuscripts purporting to contain the same liturgy. But each manuscript appears to represent that form of the given liturgy or liturgies known and in use at the time and place at which the manuscript itself originated. Furthermore, nothing certain is known as to the author, the date, or the place of composition of most of these liturgies. Mr. Swainson, in the introduction to his "*Greek Liturgies*," says: "The first record we have of the existence of Liturgies ascribed to St. Basil and St. James is in a canon (no. XXXII) of the Council held 'in Trullo,' A.D. 692." Another canon of the same Council (no. LII) mentions the "Liturgy of the Presanctified." It is true that a treatise, attributed to Proclus, Patriarch of Constantinople from 434 to about 446, "states that both Clement and James were authors of Liturgies, that Basil reduced the length of the services as he found them in his day, and then our father John of the golden mouth cut them down still more." But this treatise is probably much later than Proclus. Mabillon, in the preface to "*De Liturgia Gallicana*," quotes a letter from Charles the Bald to the clergy of Ravenna, from which it appears that about the year 860 the "Liturgy of St. Basil" was in use in Constantinople, the "Liturgy of St. James" at Jerusalem. "The words quoted by Mabillon have frequently been referred to, but it is not known where the letter is to be found in full; and thus a strange doubt hangs over them. The more important portion of the letter is said to have proceeded as follows: 'Celebrata etiam sunt coram nobis missarum solemnia more Hierosolymitano, auctore Jacobo Apostolo, et more Constantinopolitano auctore Basilio: sed nos sequendam ducimus Romanam ecclesiam in missarum celebratione.'"

But the most valuable information of all on this subject is contained in the message sent by Theodore Balsamon, librarian at Constantinople and afterwards Patriarch of Antioch, to Mark, Patriarch of Alexandria, at the beginning of the thirteenth century: "We see therefore," he said, "that neither from the Holy Scriptures nor from any canon synodically issued have we ever heard that a Liturgy was handed down by the holy Apostle Mark: and the thirty-second canon of the Council held 'in Trullo' is the only authority that a mystic Liturgy was composed by the holy James, the brother of the Lord. Neither does the eighty-fifth canon of the Apostles nor the fifty-ninth canon of the Council of Laodicea make any mention whatever of these Liturgies, nor does the Catholic Church of the Oecumenical See of Constantinople in any way acknowledge them. We decide therefore that they ought not to be received; and that all Churches should follow the example of New Rome, that is Constantinople, and celebrate according to the traditions of the great teachers and luminaries of the Church, the holy John Chrysostom and the holy Basil" (Swainson, introd. pp. xxvii–xxxi).

None of our manuscripts of any liturgy therefore necessarily represent the liturgy used in the churches of Northern Syria between the third and the seventh centuries. The wide divergences, not only between the different extant liturgies, but also between the different versions of the same liturgy, make it seem highly probable that none of our manuscripts *do* represent such a liturgy. That there was a liturgy, however, at that time, and indeed as early as the second century — perhaps from the very beginning of the Christian religion — is abundantly proved by the "*Didache of the Apostles*," and by the writings of Church Fathers such as Clement of Rome and Origen. Moreover, those passages which the Greek versions and the Syriac versions of the "Liturgy of St. James" have in common make it probable, as Sir William Palmer has pointed out, that certain portions of this liturgy were in existence, and were probably in use, in Northern Syria before the schism which took place not long after the Council of Chalcedon in 451. It follows that the absence of the text

of an inscription from the extant texts of the liturgies does not prove that this text was not contained in a liturgy at all. On the contrary a liturgy, fragments of which are found in inscriptions of the fourth, fifth, and sixth centuries, is much older than the present form of most, perhaps all, of the traditional liturgies. And I think that we may expect to find also that the earlier liturgy made more direct use of the Scriptures, and perhaps also clung more closely to the traditional forms of the Jewish service. Most of the inscriptions of which I am speaking are of this sort. A few of them, as we have seen, are contained verbatim in an extant liturgy; but the majority of them are not. Many of these, however, are so similar in sense and phraseology to passages in the traditional liturgies, that it is possible in many cases to say in what part of the service they probably occurred. Others again, while not so suggestive of particular passages in the traditional Christian liturgies, either reflect phrases which are known to have occurred in the Jewish ritual, or contain quotations from the Scriptures — generally, of course, from the Psalms — appropriate to a Church service. Of these I can give only a brief summary here: the inscriptions themselves will appear in full in the publications of the expedition of which I was a member.

7. Among the epigraphical texts which are most akin to definite passages in the traditional liturgies are such phrases as

Ἐν ὀνόματι Πατρός, κ(αὶ) Υ(ἱ)οῦ, κ(αὶ) ἁγίου Πν(εύματο)ς. Ἀμήν·

In the name of the Father, and of the Son, and of the Holy Spirit. Amen,

found at Dêr Sambil. With this we may compare Matt. xxviii. 19, the "*Didache of the Apostles*," cap. VI, and many passages in all the liturgies. Or the following, which forms the first part of an inscription on a large doorway at Bābisḳā:

8. Ἐν ὀνόματι Κ(υρίο)υ Ἰ(ησο)ῦ Χ(ριστο)ῦ·

In (*the*) *name of* (*the*) *Lord Jesus Christ.*

Cf. Acts viii. 16, and xix. 5, Warren, p. 11 ff. (cf. also "Lit. of St. James," Sw. p. 236). Or

9. Ἐν ὠνόματι τῆς ἁγίας Τριάδ(ο)ς . . . ἰνδ. δι', τ(οῦ) θϘφ' (ἔτους)·

In the name of the holy Trinity . . . Indiction 14, *in the year* 599 (*i.e.* 550 A.D.),

found at Dâr Ḳîtā, or

10. Ἐν ὀνόματι Πατρ]ός, καὶ Υἱ[ο]ῦ, καὶ ἁγίου Πνεύμ(ατος) κ(αὶ) τῆς θε[οτόκου κτλ.

In the name of the Father, and of the Son, and of the Holy Spirit, and of the Mother-of-God, etc.

an inscription on two fragments of a large lintel now lying within the walls of a ruined church at Dêr Sêtā (Wad. no. 2679). Doubtless some, if not all, of these were formulae of baptism, and consequently familiar to all Christians.

11. One of the commonest of these texts is to be found in four inscriptions, all connected with churches, one in Bāḳirḥā, and three in Dâr Ḳîtā: the latter are dated 418, 431, and 537 A.D. respectively:

Εἷς Θεὸς καὶ ὁ Χριστὸς αὐτοῦ καὶ τὸ ἅγιον Πνεῦμα·

(*There is*) *one God and his Christ and the Holy Spirit.*

This seems to be a kind of abbreviated creed. It may be compared, however, with such passages in the liturgies as *e.g.* from the Alexandrine liturgy (Sw. p. 66): *Εἷς Πατὴρ ἅγιος, εἷς Υἱὸς ἅγιος, ἓν Πνεῦμα ἅγιον, εἰς ἑνότητα Πνεύματος ἁγίου. Ἀμήν.* Similar passages occur in the "Liturgy of St. Basil" (Sw. p. 86), the "Liturgy of St. Chrysostom" (Sw. p. 94), the "Liturgy of St. James" (Sw. p. 310), the "Liturgy of the Presanctified" (Sw. p. 98), and in the lectures of Cyril of Jerusalem to the newly baptized (Sw. p. 210). The Bāḳirḥā inscription contains, after the formula given above, the words *βοηθήσε(ι ?) τοὺς φουβουμένους αὐτοῦ*: *He shall help them that fear Him,* while in the latest of the inscriptions from Dâr Ḳîtā the formula is followed by the word *βοηθη* or *βοηθης*. Similar texts occur frequently, *e.g.* at Djūwānîyeh: *Εἷς Θεὸς καὶ ὁ Χριστὸς αὐτοῦ*; at the same place, dated 398 A.D.: *Εἷς Θεὸς μόνος ὁ βοηθῶν πᾶσιν τοῖς φιλ(οῦσιν αὐτόν ?)*; and at the same place again, dated 374 A.D.: *Εἷς Θεὼς ὁ βωηθῶν τοὺς φωβουμένους αὐτοῦ.*

12. A similar text is curiously combined with others in the oldest of all dated Christian inscriptions in Syria, found by Waddington on the lintel of a doorway at Ḳātûrā: it is dated 331 A.D. (Wad. no. 2704):

Ἰησοῦ] Χρηστέ, βοήθ[ει. Εἷς Θεὸς μόνος. Ἔκτισεν Θάλασις. Ὅσα λέγις, φίλε, κέ σοι τὰ διπλ(ᾶ). Ἔτους πτ΄. Εἴσελθε, Χ(ριστ)έ·

Jesus Christ help (us)! (There is) one God only. Thalasis built (this). Whatsoever thou sayest, friend, (may that be) unto thee also, twofold! In the year 380. Enter, O Christ!

The words εἴσελθε Χριστὲ recall a passage which occurs in the "Liturgy of St. Basil" (Sw. p. 86) and in the "Liturgy of St. Chrysostom" (Sw. p. 93): Πρόσχες, Κύριε Ἰησοῦ Χριστέ, . . . καὶ ἐλθὲ εἰς τὸ ἁγιάσαι ἡμᾶς.

13. Another sentence, very common in certain localities — I found it on the lintels of three houses in il-Bârah, including Wad. no. 2646 — is the following:

Κύρ(ιος) φυλάξῃ τὴν ἴσοδόν σου καὶ τὴν ἔξοδον ἀπὸ τοῦ νῦν καὶ ἕως τῶν αἰώνων. Ἀμήν·

The Lord shall preserve thy coming in and thy going out from this time forth and for evermore. Amen.

The same is found also in an inscription at Taltîtā, dated 570 A.D. The passage is taken originally from Ps. cxx. 8. It may be compared, however, with a passage at the end of the "Clementine" liturgy (Brightman, *Liturgies, Eastern and Western*, 1896, p. 27): Τοὺς οἴκους αὐτῶν φύλαξον, τὰς εἰσόδους αὐτῶν καὶ τὰς ἐξόδους φρούρησον. Compare also the following sentence from Chrysostom's account of the service in his day (Sw. p. 218): Παρακαλέσωμεν . . . ἵνα εὐλογήσῃ τὰς εἰσόδους αὐτῶν καὶ τὰς ἐξόδους πάντα τὸν βίον αὐτῶν. Cf. the Alexandrine liturgy, Sw. p. 32.

14. The following inscription is from a tomb, in the form of a temple distyle in antis, at Ruwêḥā, and contains the date 384 A.D. (*C.I.G.* no. 4462):

Εἷς Θεὸς μόνος ὁ βοηθ(ῶν). Ὑπὲρ σωτηρίας καὶ μνήμ(ης) τῶν ζόντων. Ἀνενέωσεν Βάσσιμας καὶ Μαθβαβέα, ἔτους γλυ΄.

(*There is*) *one God only that giveth aid. For the safety and remembrance of the living. Bassimas and Mathbabea renewed* (*this tomb*), *in the year 433.*

This recalls such oft-repeated passages in the liturgies, as for example in the "Liturgy of St. James" (Sw. p. 312): Ἔτι δὲ καὶ ὑπὲρ σωτηρίας καὶ ἀφέσεως ἁμαρτιῶν τῷ προσενέγκαντι ἀδελφῷ ἡμῶν. Καὶ ὑπὲρ μνήμης τῶν ὁσίων πατέρων ἡμῶν καὶ ἀδελφῶν, εἴπωμεν πάντες ἐκτενῶς. In the inscription I believe that the words τῶν ζόντων refer to those living the life beyond the grave, as in the prayer for the dead in this same liturgy (Sw. p. 300): Ἐκεῖ αὐτοὺς ἀνάπαυσον ἐν χώρᾳ ζώντων, ἐν βασιλείᾳ οὐρανῶν, . . . εἰς κόλπους Ἀβραάμ, κτλ. In that case, and if the punctuation given above is correct, this inscription implies a belief on the part of these Christians of 384 A.D. in the efficacy of prayer for the estate of the dead. Much stress, however, cannot be laid on this phrase ὑπὲρ σωτηρίας καὶ μνήμης, which might easily have been suggested by the stereotyped ὑπὲρ σωτηρίας καὶ νίκης, which is comparatively common in the inscriptions of Syria, *e.g.* Wad. nos. 2035, 2071, 2545, etc.

15. The interior of a tomb at Shnân contains the following:

Ἀθάνατος ὤν, π[ο](λ)λὰ πάθ(η) ὑπέμινεν,	B (or Θ?)ΥΜΓ
Ἰησοῦς ὁ Χρειστός.	ΒΥΜΓ
Γένος Δαουίδ, οὐράνιος κλάδος,	ΒΥΜΓ
Ἰησοῦς ὁ Χρειστός.	ΒΥΜΓ
(Δ)οξαζόμενος [μο]νογενής, ἀθάνατος, ἐν πάσε τῇ γῇ,	ΒΥΜΓ
Ἰησοῦς ὁ Χρειστός.	ΒΥΜΓ

Though immortal, he endured many sufferings, Jesus the Christ.
Race of David, heavenly branch, Jesus the Christ.
Extolled (*the*) *Only-begotten, Immortal* (*One*), *in all the earth, Jesus the Christ.*

The four letters at the end of each line may stand for Θ(εοῦ) υ(ἱὸς) Μ(αρίας) γ(εννηθείς): *Son of God, born of Mary* (cf. Waddington's commentary on inscr. no. 2145). The second sentence of the inscription may be compared with the "eighteen Benedictions" of the Jewish ritual, sec. 14 b (Warren, pp. 213 and 243; cf. also Luke i. 69): "The branch of David Thy

servant speedily cause to flourish, and exalt his horn with Thy help, etc." ; but the rest resembles to no small degree the hymn which, according to Dr. Neale, is indicated by the words Ὁ *μονογενὴς Υἱὸς καὶ Λόγος* in the Alexandrine liturgy (Sw. p. 12): Ὁ *μονογενὴς Υἱὸς καὶ Λόγος τοῦ Θεοῦ ἀθάνατος ὑπάρχων, καταδεξάμενος διὰ τὴν ἡμετέραν σωτηρίαν σαρκωθῆναι ἐκ τῆς ἁγίας θεοτόκου καὶ ἀειπαρθένου Μαρίας, ἀτρέπτως ἐνανθρωπήσας, σταυρωθείς τε, Χριστὲ ὁ Θεός, θανάτῳ θάνατον πατήσας, εἷς ὢν τῆς ἁγίας Τριάδος, συνδοξαζόμενος τῷ Πατρὶ καὶ τῷ ἁγίῳ Πνεύματι, σῶσον ἡμᾶς.* The same hymn is referred to in the "Liturgy of St. James" (Sw. p. 220 f. ; cf. also Sw. pp. 303 and 308).

16. But the most interesting of all, in my opinion, is an inscription, hitherto unpublished, belonging to the so-called "Tomb of Diogenes" in Ḥâss :

Ὁ τὸ ζῆν χαρισάμενος τῷ ἀν θρωπίνῳ γένι, κὲ τὸ τελευτᾶ ν διὰ σφάλμα ἐντιλάμενος, κὲ τὴν ἀνάστασιν ἐν ἐλέει κ ὲ οἰκτιρμοῖς ἰδ(ί)οις ἐπανγιλάμ ενος, κὲ ἀραβωνίσας, Χ(ριστό)ς, ἐπί σκεψε τῷ σωτηρίῳ σου τὸν δο ῦλόν σου Ἀντωνῖνο(ν) Διογέ νου(ς) καὶ Δομετίαν, γαμετὴν αὐτοῦ, κὲ τοὺς λοιποὺς ἐνταῦθ α κοιμωμένους, τοῦ ἰδῖν ἐν τ ῇ χρηστότητι τῶν ἐγλε(κ)τῶν σ[ου]·

Thou who gavest life to the human race, and didst enjoin death on account of transgression, and in thine own loving-kindness and tender mercies didst promise the resurrection, and gavest a pledge, Christ, visit with thy salvation thy servant Antoninus son of Diogenes, and Dometia his wife, and the others who lie at rest here, that they may see the good of thy chosen.

The phrase *ἐν ἐλέει καὶ οἰκτιρμοῖς* is found in Ps. cii. 4, and the latter part of the inscription is evidently taken ultimately from Ps. cv. 4 f. : *Ἐπίσκεψαι ἡμᾶς ἐν τῷ σωτηρίῳ σου, τοῦ ἰδεῖν ἐν τῇ χρηστότητι τῶν ἐκλεκτῶν σου.* But how closely the whole inscription is allied, both in phraseology and in spirit, to the traditional liturgies, may be seen by comparing the following passages, selected in the order in which they occur, from the "Liturgy of St. Basil" (Sw. pp. 76 to 83):

Ὁ τὰς κοινὰς ταύτας καὶ συμφώνους ἡμῖν χαρισάμενος προσευχάς, . . . καὶ ἐν τῷ μέλλοντ ζωὴν αἰώνιον χαριζόμενος.

Καὶ ἐπίσκεψαι ἡμᾶς ἐν τῇ χρηστότητί σου.

Ἐπίβλεψον καὶ ἐπὶ τοὺς δούλους σου τοὺς κατηχουμένους, κτλ.

Ὁ Θεός, ὁ ἐπισκεψάμενος ἐν ἐλέει καὶ οἰκτιρμοῖς τὴν ταπείνωσιν ἡμῶν, κτλ.

Πατὴρ τοῦ Κυρίου ἡμῶν Ἰησοῦ Χριστοῦ, . . . παρ' οὗ τὸ Πνεῦμα τὸ ἅγιον ἐξεφάνη, . . . ὁ ἀρραβὼν τῆς μελλούσης κληρονομίας, κτλ.

Πλάσας γὰρ τὸν ἄνθρωπον, . . . τέθεικας αὐτὸν ἐν παραδείσῳ τῆς τρυφῆς, ἀθανασίαν ζωῆς καὶ ἀπόλαυσιν αἰωνίων ἀγαθῶν ἐν τῇ τηρήσει τῶν ἐντολῶν σου ἐπαγγειλάμενος αὐτῷ. Ἀλλὰ . . . νεκρωθέντα (τε) τοῖς οἰκείοις αὐτοῦ παραπτώμασιν, . . . ἀπέστρεψας αὐτὸν εἰς τὴν γῆν ἐξ ἧς ἐλήφθη, οἰκονομῶν αὐτῷ τὴν ἐκ παλιγγενεσίας σωτηρίαν τὴν ἐν αὐτῷ τῷ Χριστῷ σου.

Ἐπειδὴ γὰρ δι' ἀνθρώπου ἡ ἁμαρτία εἰσῆλθεν εἰς τὸν κόσμον, καὶ διὰ τῆς ἁμαρτίας ὁ θάνατος, κτλ.

Ὁδοποιήσας πάσῃ σαρκὶ τὴν ἐκ νεκρῶν ἀνάστασιν, . . . ἐγένετο ἀπαρχὴ τῶν κεκοιμημένων, κτλ.

Ἐπίσκεψαι ἡμᾶς, ὁ Θεός. Καὶ μνήσθητι πάντων τῶν πιστῶς κεκοιμημένων ἐπ' ἐλπίδι ἀναστάσεως ζωῆς αἰωνίου, καὶ ἀνάπαυσον αὐτοὺς ὅπου ἐπισκόπει τὸ φῶς τοῦ προσώπου σου.

Lastly, there are two passages, one of which (17) is contained in one, the other (18) in two Syriac inscriptions from this region, communicated to me by Dr. Littmann:

17. *Deliver me, O Lord, from the evil man.*

This is derived from Ps. cxxxix. 1: Ἐξελοῦ με, Κύριε, ἐξ ἀνθρώπου πονηροῦ, κτλ.; but the passage may also be compared with the following, from the "*Didache of the Apostles*" (Sw. p. xlix): Μνήσθητι, Κύριε, τῆς ἐκκλησίας σου τοῦ ῥύσασθαι αὐτὴν ἀπὸ παντὸς πονηροῦ. Compare also, from the Alexandrine liturgy (Sw. p. 4): Πᾶσαν πονηρῶν ἀνθρώπων ἐπιβουλὴν ἐκδίωξον ἀφ' ἡμῶν, ὁ Θεός, καὶ ἀπὸ τῆς ἁγίας σου καθολικῆς καὶ ἀποστολικῆς ἐκκλησίας, and from the "Liturgy of St. James" (Sw. p. 306 ff.): Κύριε . . . ῥῦσαι ἡμᾶς ἀπὸ τοῦ πονηροῦ, καὶ ἀπὸ τῶν ἔργων αὐτοῦ. And

18. *Let God arise, and let all his enemies be scattered.*

This is derived from Ps. lxvii. 2: Ἀναστήτω ὁ Θεός, καὶ διασκορπισθήτωσαν οἱ ἐχθροὶ αὐτοῦ, κτλ. A somewhat different version of the same passage occurs repeatedly in the various Alexandrine liturgies, *e.g.* Sw. p. 20: Ἐξεγέρθητι,

Κύριε, καὶ διασκορπισθήτωσαν οἱ ἐχθροί σου. Compare also Sw. pp. 17, 23, and 46 f.

I have not made any thorough comparison between the texts furnished by these inscriptions and what remains to us of the Jewish ritual of the early Christian centuries. But two inscriptions resemble closely those portions of that ritual which are quoted, for purposes of comparison, by Mr. Warren in his book on the *Liturgy and Ritual of the Ante-Nicene Church*, to which I have already referred.

19. One of these is from il-Bârah, and has been published by Waddington, no. 2652:

Γένοιτο, Κύριε, τὸ ἔλεός σου ἐφ' ἡμᾶς καθάπ[ερ ἠλπίσαμεν ἐπὶ σέ.

Let thy mercy, O Lord, be upon us, according as we hope in thee.

This is derived from Ps. xxxii. 22: it is also contained in the "Eighteen Benedictions," or the "Prayer '*Shemonah Esrah*'" of the Jewish ritual, sec. 13 (Warren, p. 212): "On us bestow, O Lord our God, Thy mercy; give ample reward to all who trust in Thy name in sincerity, make our portion with them for ever, and let us not be ashamed, for we trust in Thee." There is something similar, but not identical, in the "Liturgy of St. Basil" (Sw. p. 86), and in the "Liturgy of St. James" (Sw. p. 308 ff.).

20. The second is from a ruined house at Djūwānîyeh:

Κύριος βασιλεύει εἰς ἐῶνα.

The Lord is king for ever.

Ps. xxviii. 10 contains the words: Καθιεῖται Κύριος βασιλεὺς εἰς τὸν αἰῶνα. Compare with this the following passage from the "*Kedusha*" (Warren, p. 215): "And in Thy Holy Word it is written, thus saying . . . 'The Lord shall reign for ever and ever, Thy God, O Zion, from generation to generation.'" Compare also the "*Didache of the Apostles*," sec. 14, and the "*Apostolic Constitutions*," VII, 30 (Sw. p. li), the "Liturgy of St. James" (Sw. p. 270), and the Alexandrine liturgy (Sw. p. 7).

Besides these there are the following inscriptions, which contain quotations from the Psalms, and one which contains

a passage from the New Testament, appropriate to a Church service, but to which I have not been able to find a parallel in any traditional liturgy:

21. Ps. iv. 8 f., from a large house in il-Bârah (Wad. no. 2648):

Ἔ[δω]κάς μοι εὐ[φροσ]ύνην εἰ[ς] τὴν καρδίαν μου. Ἀπὸ καρποῦ σίτου καὶ οἴνου καὶ ἐλλέου ἐνεπλήσθημεν ἐν ἰρήνῃ.

22. Ps. xxiii. 1 (cf. also Ps. lxxxviii. 12 and cxiii. 24), from two tombs in Dêr Sambil:

Τοῦ Κυρίου *ἡ γῆ καὶ τὸ πλήρωμα αὐτῆς καὶ [πάν]τες οἱ κατοικ(ο)ῦντες ἐν αὐτῇ.* ΧΜΓ.

Τῷ Κυρίῳ *ἐστὶν οἱ οὐρανοί, ἡ γῆ καὶ τὸ πλήρωμα αὐτῆς . . .*

23. Ps. xlv. 8 and 12: two inscriptions, one on two fragments in il-Bârah (Wad. no. 2649), the other on a lintel in Dânā (Wad. no. 2676):

Κύριος *τῶν δυνάμεων μεθ᾽ ἐμῶν ἐστί.*

Κύριο(ς *τ)[ῶν] δυνάμε(ων με)θ᾽ ἡμῶν, ἀντ(ι)λή(π)τω(ρ) ἡμῶν ὁ θεὸς* Εἰακῶβ.

The words *Κύριε τῶν δυνάμεων* occur not infrequently in the liturgies, *e.g.* Sw. pp. 282, 306, 89, etc.

24. From a lintel in Dânā (Wad. no. 2677):

Μ[α]*κάριος ἄνθρωπος ὃς [ἐλπίζει] ἐπὶ* [Κύ]*ριον, κὲ οὐ μὴ ἀπω[λεῖται* (?).

This seems to be from Ps. xxxiii. 9: *Γεύσασθε καὶ ἴδετε ὅτι χρηστὸς ὁ* Κύριος· *μακάριος ἀνὴρ ὃς ἐλπίζει ἐπ᾽ αὐτόν*, and perhaps vs. 23: Καὶ *οὐ μὴ πλημμελήσουσιν πάντες οἱ ἐλπίζοντες ἐπ᾽ αὐτόν.* Cf. also Ps. lxxxiii. 13. The first part of Ps. xxxiii. 9 occurs in the liturgies, apparently as the beginning of a hymn, the rest of which is omitted in the Mss. (*e.g.* Sw. p. 316 f., etc.).

25. Ps. xc. 1 f.: the words are painted on the lintel of a large dwelling in Ruwêḥā (Wad. no. 2672):

Ὁ *κατοικῶν ἐν βοηθίᾳ τοῦ ὑψίστου, ἐν σκέπῃ το[ῦ θεο]ῦ τοῦ οὐρανοῦ [αὐλισ]θήσεται· ἐ[ρεῖ τ]ῷ* Κυρ[ιῳ], Ἀντι[λή]*πτωρ μου ε[ἶ καὶ κ]αταφυγή μου, [ὁ θεός μου, ἐλπιῶ ἐπ᾽ αὐτόν].*

A part of the same passage appears to be contained in a much mutilated inscription on a sarcophagus at Midjleyyā, and also in the two Syriac inscriptions mentioned above (17 and 18).

26. From Ps. cxii. 7, on a lintel at Midjleyyā (Wad. no. 2651):

> Χριστὸ]ς ἀεὶ νικᾷ. Πίστις, ἐλπίς, ἀγαπή.
> Ἐγίρει ἀπὸ γῆς πτωχὸν καὶ ἀπὸ κοπρίας ἀνυ[ψ]οῖ πένητα.

The latter part of the first line may be compared with a passage in the "Liturgy of the Presanctified" (Sw. p. 96): *Βεβαίωσον αὐτοὺς ἐν τῇ πίστει· στήριξον ἐν ἐλπίδι· τελείωσον ἐν ἀγαπῇ.*

27. Romans viii. 31, on the lintels of three houses in Dellôzā, one of which has been published by Waddington, no. 2666:

> Εἰ Θεὼς ὑπὲρ ἡμôν, τίς ὁ καθ' ἡμôν; ΧΜΓ.

Waddington's inscription has *ὑμῶν* for *ἡμῶν*, and after the quotation the words: *Δόξα αὐτῷ πάντοτε*: one of the others has: ΕΝΩΘΕΟΣ.

These are not all the liturgical inscriptions from Northern Syria; but they are the best examples. I think it is evident that many of them contain fragments of the early liturgy of that country. Of course they are very far from being sufficient in themselves to enable us to restore that liturgy. But as fragments they have a peculiar value. They represent the liturgy at a stage for which we have only the most uncertain kind of literary tradition, all of them have a definite provenance, and many of them can be definitely dated. And hence I trust that they, together with those which may yet be found in this region and those which may be collected in other fields, may be used as auxiliaries to the literary tradition in obtaining a more accurate knowledge of the ritual, and to some extent of the doctrines, of the fourth, fifth, and sixth centuries, a most important period in the development of the Christian Church.

